

Reviews

Studies in the History of Worship in Scotland, edd. D. Forrester and D. Murray
Edinburgh, 1984.

The first paragraph of the Introduction partially disarms a reviewer when the hope is expressed that the book 'will be stimulating rather than definitive'. Disregarding the next two paragraphs of caricature, great expectations of a new approach arise. There it is asserted that the authors 'have tried to keep in mind the economic, social and political context'. However, on reading the traditional and generally workmanlike contents, there is little evidence of that 'new kind of history' envisaged by Lucien Febvre¹ and, while the preface laments the subject as being 'a field of study which has been sadly neglected in recent years', there is the same neglect by the contributors in the use of scholarly studies in related fields which have appeared on the continent.

'The Beginnings' by I. Muirhead offers little that is original and suffers from a failure to consider archeological evidence, which is all the more surprising when the works of such scholars as Thomas² are used for other matters.

The most unexpected omissions are Hardinge³ and the massive researches of F. Chisolm⁴. The Celtic Churches' relationships with Rome are defectively described⁵ and need revision particularly in the light of Nora Chadwick's works⁶ which are not even mentioned. J. Galbraith's 'The Middle Ages' is helpful but lifeless. There is for example no mention of the spectacular dimension of much medieval worship which has received considerable attention⁷ although his views on medieval preaching are optimistically exuberant! Gordon Donaldson's two contributions, 'Reformation to Covenant' and 'Covenant to Revolution' summarise his previous scholarly work. A consideration of Zwinglian influence has still to be undertaken for both periods which would prevent such old fashioned statements as those of D. Murray.⁸ H. Sefton in 'Revolution to Disruption' provides a useful outline as does D. Murray in 'Disruption to Union' although it would have been interesting to have had in the latter paper a consideration of the adverse effects of middle class missions to working class urban areas⁹ on the subsequent sparse participation in worship and an investigation into the reasons for the disappearance of a large number of the churches which were greatly influenced by 'high churchmen'¹⁰. D. Forrester's discursive 'Worship since 1929', of which much is marginal to a history of worship, is engagingly considered. His views on the reasons for the catastrophic decline in membership of the Church of Scotland¹¹ ignore the prophetic words of D. Allan Easton¹² which were treated with scornful disdain by the contemporary 'establishment' but, forty years on,

are being fulfilled. Another detrimental influence was the 'genteelisation' of the Church which was still being demonstrated in the Church Hymnary, Third Edition¹³.

Allan MacLean in 'Episcopal Worship in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries' may be aware of the fruits of 'genteelism' as he mentions nothing of the 'unending worship of God'¹⁴ in that Church after 1930. M. Dilworth's 'Roman Catholic Worship' draws on the researches inspired by The Innes Review and reflects its spirit of scholarship and openness.

The two chapters which fail to integrate into the volume are D. Read's 'The Scottish Tradition of Preaching' which reads as if it had been originally written for an entirely different audience - it would have been better appreciated by the readership of Life and Work - and J. Whyte's 'The Setting of Worship' which is only concerned with developments in Scotland after 1560.

It is surprising that the Gaelic contribution to Scottish worship and devotional life whether medieval¹⁵ or modern¹⁶, is totally lacking although the much less significant place of the small Episcopal Church in Scotland has a chapter to itself. 'The typical Evangelical Highlander brought into the treasury of the larger Church....certain elements of abiding value.'¹⁷.

The main criticism, however, is the overall approach which has produced a book which is really a fragmentary history of liturgical practice rather than a history of worship. The place, the needs and the role of the worshipper are in general passed over in silence. Thus there is, for example, no consideration of church praise (the references to the introduction of hymns¹⁸ and the Church Hymnary, third edition¹⁹, are largely concerned with administrative decisions), personal devotional attitudes, family worship, what the worshippers give and receive in worship, and much else.

Your reviewer has allowed himself to be 'stimulated' in his criticisms, which could have been much greater. It is his hope that the publisher will consider the publication of a volume on the same theme after 'stimulated' critiques, resulting from this publication, inspire a more 'definitive' and coherent piece of work.

DUNCAN SHAW.
CRAIGENTINNY
EDINBURGH

FOOTNOTES

1. Revue de metaphysique et de morale. lviii (1949)
2. C. Thomas, The Early Christian Archaeology of North Britain. Oxford 1971.
3. L. Hardinge, The Celtic Church in Britain. London 1972
4. Th. D. Thesis, Toronto.
5. 5, 5,7.
6. e.g. her contributions in Studies in the early British Church. various edd. Cambridge. 1958 and in Celt and Saxon. various edd. Cambridge. 1963 and The Age of the Saints in the Early Celtic Church. London. 1963. of K. Hughes, 'The Celtic Church and the Papacy' in The English Church and the Papacy in the Middle Ages. ed. C.H. Lawrence. London 1965. and 'The Celtic Church: is this a valid concept?' in Cambridge Medieval Celtic Studies. 1. (1981)
7. O.B. Hardison, Junr., Christian Rite and Christian Drama in the Middle Ages. Baltimore. 1965, and T. Stemmler, Liturgische Feiern und Geistliche Spiele. Tubingen. 1970.
8. 82. of e.g. J. Courvoisier, 'Reflexions à propos de la doctrine eucharistique de Zwingli et Calvin' in Festgabe Leonard von Muralt. Zum 70 Geburtstag, 17 Mai 1970. Zurich. 1970 258-65.
9. of e.g. A.L. Drummond and J. Bulloch, The Church in Victorian Scotland, 1843 - 1874. Edinburgh. 1975 50.
10. 87
11. 160 - 61
12. D. Allan Easton, "Now's the Day" A Challenge to the Church of Scotland." Edinburgh. 1947.
13. Compare e.g. Hymn 476 in CH3 with Hymn 370 in the previous edition. Even the Psalter is not genteel enough: when Psalm 72 appears twice in CH3 as Hymns 158 and 167, verse 9 is omitted in both cases. There are many more examples! This genteelism had, of course, its origins outside the Church. (Cf. D. Daiches. Literature and Gentility in Scotland. Edinburgh, 1982, p. 35-71)
14. 110
15. cf. e.g. Carmina Gadelica, various edd., Edinburgh. 1928-54. 5 vols.
16. cf. e.g. 'The Gaelic religious posts: their teaching and influence, 1688-1800' in J. MacInnes, The Evangelical Movement in the Highlands. Aberdeen. 1951. 262-94.
17. MacInnes, *ibid.* 8
18. 72, 89-90.
19. 164-5

"Teenagers and the Church"

Leslie J. Francis

Collins Liturgical Publications, 167pp £7.95p.

This volume is sub-titled 'A profile of church going youth in the 1980's'. Its concern is not with the drift of teenagers from the Church but with the views and attitudes of those who actually attend church regularly. Why do they keep going? What do they look for from the churches, and how satisfied are they with what they find? What can the churches learn from the teenagers whom they continue to attract?

The answers to such questions are sought by the direct method of asking the consumer over thirteen hundred consumer in fact, in the age range thirteen to twenty, divided into three main groupings, Roman Catholic Church, Church of England and Free Churches. The project was directed from St. Martin's College, Lancaster and those surveyed lived in six areas of Lancashire carefully chosen 'in the hope that they would be representative of a particular type of area which could be compared with similar areas in other parts of the country.' Some initial difficulty was encountered on account of a certain reluctance on the part of many churches to co-operate. Out of one hundred and fifty one congregations approached, ninety actually took part. This in itself indicates a marked ecclesiastical nervousness in discussing work amongst teenagers. The corollary of the well known maxim, 'Nothing succeeds like success' is presumably 'Nothing fails like failure'.

However, as already noted, the main thought of this exercise was not to point to failure, but to seek the views of those with whom the churches were succeeding. Nevertheless the point is made that for every 24 thirteen or fourteen year old church-goers we can expect there to be 22 fifteen year olds, 19 sixteen year olds, 15 seventeen year olds, 11 eighteen year olds, 8 nineteen year olds and 7 twenty year olds.

The methodology of the research is meticulously detailed. Thereafter the views of the young people are set out on such matters as public worship, religious beliefs, moral attitudes, politics and society, work and leisure, well being and worry. Finally a series of character sketches are offered portraying the background and outlook of typical teenage church goers.

Much that is set out here will provide helpful documentary confirmation of what many who work with teenagers in churches already know to be the case, though there are some surprises. I was rather taken aback by the strength of fundamentalism - 48% of Free Church teenagers accept the belief that God made the world in six days, and rested on the seventh, compared with 19% who reject it. The comparable statistics in the Roman Catholic Church are 35% accepting and 41% rejecting. In the Church of England 36% accept, 32% reject. Another interesting detail is that the young people

believe that the three most important qualities the clergy should display are friendliness, being in touch and approachability. Ministers reading this will be heartened to learn that 98% of Free Church teenagers, 94% of Anglicans and 90% of Roman Catholics say that their minister or priest is a friendly person. Lest this encourage complacency, however, it should be remembered that many who do not find the clergy friendly will presumably have ceased to be regular church-goers.

While reflecting the English situation there is much here that is relevant to the Scottish scene. Twenty four years ago the General Assembly commended the report of Dr. John Sutherland, 'Godly Upbringing' which sought to analyse the reasons for the falling off in numbers attending Sunday Schools and Bible Classes. A report presented to the General Assembly this year by the Youth Education Committee recalls Sutherland's work and commends this whole question yet again to the serious consideration of Kirk Sessions. Francis is more concerned with the young people who remain, whereas Sutherland's remit was those who were leaving. There is always the danger that in our proper anxiety to recover the lost we neglect the young people happily in our care. Indeed perhaps they are the very ones who if effectively ministered to can attract their missing peers. But first we must listen to what they are saying, and Dr Francis' excellent book provides a concise and helpful way of doing just that.

FINLAY A. J. MACDONALD.
JORDANHILL
GLASGOW

In Issue No. 7 Wilfred Norris reviewed 'Church Music in a Changing World' by Dr. Lionel Dakers. (Mowbray pb 113 pp £ 1.95). He included, with his review, the following reflections:

SOME REFLECTIONS ON DR. DAKERS' BOOK BY A PRACTISING ORGANIST IN SCOTLAND.

After some thirty years experience as Organist and Choirmaster in typical Scottish suburban churches with no musical advantages, I should like to add a few comments to my review of Dr. Dakers' "CHURCH MUSIC IN A CHANGING WORLD.":-

We in Scotland have probably less reason than many of our English counterparts to be obsessed with the avoidance of conflict between minister and organist simply because the average Presbyterian Parish Church makes much less use of music than the average Anglican Church, so there is no reason for the minister to regard his music-leader as a dangerous rival. The Presbyterian organist takes up his post realising the limited musical scope it is likely

to offer. If that scope turns out to be even more limited than he expected, the fact that his ambitions were humbler to start with reduces his frustrations when things do not turn out as he might have hoped. The Scottish organist has charge of a province rather than an empire, and will often dispense with a mid-week choir-practice, almost universally in summer, a step which may well lead to the total disintegration and disappearance of the choir.

The role of the Presbyterian choir is often limited to leading the congregational singing of metrical psalms and hymns and contributing an anthem, (which may well be a canticle setting) though this not necessarily every Sunday. Choruses and folk-hymns often supplant the traditional fare in a desperate effort to "draw the younger folk", but such items are better accompanied on piano, and employ a style foreign to the average organist's experience. Consequently, no musician is normally consulted in the choice of such music.

This, of course, allows the keen choir more time to learn their anthems and often to prepare concerts and recitals, though these projects will depend entirely on the choirmaster's enthusiasm, energy, and spare time. In some districts several choirs will join forces in an occasional Festival Service or oratorio, though sad to say, Church Choir classes in competitive Music Festivals draw few or no entries.

The extent to which we fall short of Dr. Dakers' ideals, having it seems fewer and fewer dedicated Christians on whom to draw for our organists, strangely coincides with a time when the standard of organ-playing in Britain has never been higher, and the number of recitals and those attending them is constantly growing. Could this suggest that if there were more music in our services (organ music as well as choral), we might also have more worshippers?

WILFRED NORRIS, BA, B.MUS., FRCO,
Organist,
Bearsden South.

LITURGY RESHAPED - Edited by Kenneth Stevenson - S.P.C.K. £8.50p (181 pp)

This is an eminently readable book edited by Dr. Kenneth Stevenson. It comprises a collection of essays by a number of foremost liturgical scholars - thirteen in all. The contributions come from several denominational backgrounds: the Anglican side is represented by John Gunstone, Richard Buxton, Victor De Waal, Paul Bradshaw, Colin Buchanan, Donald Gray and Dr. Stevenson himself. Pierre-Marie Gy, OP, Edward Yarnold SJ, and Balthasar Fischer offer presentations from the Roman Catholic stand-point; while further contributions come from one Episcopalian - Thomas Talley, and two Methodists, David Tripp and Geoffrey Wainwright. Alas, it is a pity that there is an absence of contributions from Presbyterian circles. There are some who have much to offer!

This varied collection of essays begins with John Gunstone's paper entitled "The Spirit's Freedom in the Spirit's Framework" in which the charismatic movement is ascribed a place within the 'creative liturgy' of the Church. 'True spontaneity,' we are reminded, 'can only arise from a discerning appreciation of what worship really is, and of the place of traditional rites and ceremonies in its celebration.' The writer correctly deprecates those 'well-meaning attempts to create a service out of a newspaper report, a pop record, and extracts from the latest book of contemporary prayers for secular man'. Many would say 'AMEN' to that!

"Initiation: Sacrament and Experience" (by Edward Yarnold, SJ) outlines the Early Church's understanding of the efficacy of the sacraments of initiation. "The Eucharistic Prayer - Tradition and Development" (by Thomas Talley) outlines Jewish tradition and background as an introduction to the development of prayer in the eucharist. David Tripp's article on 'Shape and Liturgy' presents the case for proper form in liturgy. Richard Buxton's chapter on 'The Shape of the Eucharist: A Survey and Appraisal' again emphasises the desire for shape, especially as we see it within our own western eucharistic liturgy. "The concept of shape", the author points out, "has been one of the dominant themes of liturgical scholarship...and it has been a seminal influence on the revised and new rites of all the major Western churches, which have produced them in such abundance during the last twenty-five years" .

Geoffrey Wainwright presents a fine chapter entitled "Between God and World, Worship and Mission" where he establishes the necessary coherent task of the Church within worship, mission and evangelism. "The Church has the missionary task of proclaiming God's gospel to the world. In the other direction, the Church's responsibilities are to represent the world before God in worship. The Church's mission in the world is not only evangelistic but also liturgical. The Church's worship of God finds not only liturgical but also evangelistic expression."

Balthasar Fischer has a chapter on the "Reform of Symbols in Roman Catholic Worship - Loss or Gain?" It casts fascinating light on such aspects of symbolism as the administration of salt to candidates at baptism, and the liturgical dress of bishops some of whom, to emphasise the fulness of their office, apparently wore beneath the chasuble at the celebration of the Eucharist both the dalmatic of the deacon and the tunicle of the subdeacon! - an unforgivable practice now no longer indulged in, thus, as the author points out, lightening the burdens of office!

Further chapters are on 'Worship and Theology' (Victor De Waal), 'The Liturgical Use and Abuse of Patristics' (Paul Bradshaw) and 'Liturgical Revision in the Church of England in Retrospect' (Colin Buchanan). The Editor, Kenneth Stevenson, also presents a paper entitled "'Ye Shall Pray For...' The Intercession" where he explores the area of intercessory prayer in liturgy - its style, language and tendencies all of which affect and have influence on liturgical renewal and vice versa.

The closing chapter of the book is an appreciation by Donald Gray of the work and contribution to the liturgical scene (particularly in the Church of England) of Geoffrey Cuming, together with a Select Biography.

"LITURGY RESHAPED" contains essential reading not only for all who express an interest in the nature of the Church's worship, but also for those who are actively caught up in its regular practice and have the desire to see a fresh expression of liturgical renewal within the life and worship of the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church - a liturgical expression which cuts across denomination barriers as it seeks to direct the worshipper - lay and cleric - towards that one Mediator of all worship, Jesus Christ, through whom, by whom and in whom the Church offers her worship to the Father and in the power of the Holy Spirit.

Kenneth Stevenson is an Anglican who is Chaplain to the University of Manchester. He also teaches liturgy in the Faculty of Theology. He graduated with the degree of Master of Arts with Honours in Classics from the University of Edinburgh and then Doctor of Philosophy from the University of Southampton. During the Spring of 1983, he was visiting Professor of Liturgy at the University of Notre Dame, Indiana. He is the author of several monographs and articles as well as two books: "Family Services" and the Alcuin Club volume for 1982 on the marriage liturgy entitled "Nuptial Blessing".

KENNETH D F WALKER

ATHELSTANEFORD WITH WHITEKIRK AND TYNINGHAME

EAST LOTHIAN