

Recent Liturgical Literature

ONE of the most valuable recent contributions to liturgical study on the Protestant side is a volume by Richard Paquier, *Traité de Liturgique. Essai sur le fondement et la structure du culte*, Neuchâtel et Paris, Delachaux et Niestlé, 1954, bound pp. 228, ca. £1. This is one of the series *Manuels et Précis de Theologie*. After a short introduction on the triple office of the Church, seen in the three elements of Church life, namely, teaching, worship and *koinonia*, the work is divided into three sections, God's initiative, man's obedience, and the ecclesiastical ordo. Emphasis is laid on the fact that the Lord calls and gathers His people together, that He is ever among them, especially perhaps in time of worship in His house. The relationship of Word and Sacrament is carefully considered, and the author insists that the antithesis often set up between them is artificial. "A Word which is only read and preached, a Sacrament celebrated in silence or using words in a strange language unintelligible to the congregation, give a truncated picture of the divine action in the Church" (p. 37). Yet each has its own particular value, the Word for example as evocative of faith, the Sacrament being more synthetic, unitive and communal. A service of worship may consist merely of reading and preaching the Word, but a Sacrament cannot exist without the Word—at the very least the pronouncing of the sacramental words. Under "Man's Response", the significance of worship and many practical questions are examined. The Christian Year, the furnishing of the House of God, the proper place of liturgical celebration, vestments, liturgical colours, music and psalmody, are all brought under review. The third part discusses the actual orders of services, ordinary preaching services, the Eucharist, the Divine Office, baptismal, marriage, funeral and children's services, explaining the principles involved and making practical suggestions based upon them. Some will probably not agree with all these, but they are all worthy of consideration. Certainly this book should be read and studied by all who are interested in the conduct of public worship.

The author of this book is regarded as a leader in the Liturgical Movement in the Reformed Church in Switzerland, and he is well-known in connection with the movement

Église et Liturgie which has now reached its semi-jubilee. The organ *Verbum Caro*, published by the firm mentioned above, has now reached its tenth year as a theological and ecclesiastical review. No. 34 is devoted to the 25th anniversary of *Église et Liturgie*, and contains a valuable and interesting article by R. Paquier on the movement's progress. In the same issue he writes an article on "Répons et acclamations liturgiques", which is really a completion of chapters 7 and 8 of his *Traité*. The various responses of the congregation to the number of fifteen are examined, their real character and their normal place in worship being analysed. The article is excellent. *Verbum Caro* is a very valuable quarterly and costs about £1 per annum. Every issue contains something of interest to the reader of this *Annual*.

Another book, rather earlier in date but informed by the same spirit as that by Paquier, comes from the same publishers in their *Collection Communauté de Cluny*. The author is Max Thurian and the title is, *Joie du Ciel sur la Terre. Introduction à la vie liturgique*, 1946, pp. 236, about 9s. This is much less systematic in its nature than Paquier's work, but it also is valuable. The first part discusses the foundations of the liturgical life, beginning with the liturgical spirit, which is defined as ecumenical and should possess the qualities of objectivity, beauty, simplicity and joy. There is next a short section on the worship of the early Christians. The third chapter is called "Worship and the Incarnation", with two sections, Water and Blood, and Flesh and Spirit. The fourth is on the heavenly liturgy of the Apocalypse. The second part is entitled "The Liturgical Life To-day", and has two chapters, the first concerned with the liturgical framework (*cadre*), the church, its architecture and arrangement, liturgical objects, the Christian Year; and the second with liturgical form, the Word and the Sacrament, the Eucharistic liturgy and the Daily Office. There are six short appendices. This is, like Paquier's, a very readable book, also directed towards the more careful cultivation, deeper understanding and more perfect expression of Protestant piety. Especially there is emphasis on the need for a greater variety of forms of service. Truth is rich and varied—why should the Church have but one form of worship? A greater variety would make possible a larger response to the many-coloured wisdom of God and the incomprehensible riches of the grace of Christ.

Both these books show traces of the influence of Robert Will, and Paquier in particular expresses the hope that more

study and appreciation should be given to his three-volume treatise, *Le Culte*, which is quite the most important philosophical treatment of the subject in the last half-century, but which is still too little known.

Two articles in *Liturgisches Jahrbuch*, Vol. V, Heft 1, August, 1955, contain discussions on the same subject as Paquier's article in *Verbum Caro*, viz., liturgical responses and acclamations. The first is by Balthasar Fischer on the responses *Amen*, *Et cum spiritu tuo*, *Gloria tibi Domine*, *Deo gratias*, and those of the Preface. The second is by Theodor Schnitzler on the *Kyrie*, *Gloria*, *Credo*, *Sanctus*, and *Agnus Dei*. This periodical is now to appear quarterly instead of half-yearly, but parts 2 and 3 of Volume V have come together, as a report on the Second German Liturgical Congress which was held in Munich in August to September, 1955. Papers were read by Michael Schmaus, Josef A. Jungmann, Fritz Hofmann, Joseph Pascher, and other well-known liturgical writers. The title of the Congress was "Liturgy and Piety", and the papers dealt with the relation between various aspects of worship, as in the Eucharist and in the Daily Office, and the devotion of the worshipper, both of the priest and of the congregation, with the importance of preaching in relation to worship and piety, and similar subjects. This *Jahrbuch* continues its interest in the Liturgical Movement, with which indeed these Congresses are connected.

This brings us to some of the more important Roman Catholic works. And first one is glad to report that J. A. Jungmann's *Missarum Sollemnia* has now been completely translated both into English and into French. The English edition is done in America, published by Benzinger Brothers, and costs 70s per volume. The English title is *The Mass of the Roman Rite. Its Origin and Development*. Vol. I, 1950, pp. 494, deals with the Mass up to the Credo; Vol. II, 1955, pp. 532, from the Credo to the end of the Mass. The French edition is in three volumes, paper covers, and costs approximately £3, and is published in Paris by Aubier in the collection *Théologie*. This is the cheapest form of the work, but the English edition is beautifully printed on good paper and very well bound. A third edition of the original German has now been published. This is a most important treatise and will have considerable influence on all future studies of the Eucharist, its history and formulas. The notes are very extended and the references are very fully given. The

Indexes in the last volume will prove extremely useful. In the English edition they extend to 67 pages double column, and in the French to 54 pages of three columns each. The first part lists the liturgical sources, primitive, non-roman and Roman; and the remainder, arranged differently in the two translations, includes lists of authors and of places, and a very complete list of subjects.

Along with this must be mentioned a short work by Jungmann, *Das Eucharistische Hochgebet*, Würzburg, 1954. This is translated into French and published in Paris, 1955, under the title, *La Grande Prière Eucharistique*, while an English translation is expected to appear in Spring, *The Eucharistic Prayer. A study of the Canon Missae* (paper, 4s 6d, cloth, 6s 6d). This consists of lectures to a clergy-conference on the fundamental ideas of the Canon, based on words drawn from the Canon, *Memores, Offerimus, Plebs Sancta*, and *Socia Exsultatione*. This is an interesting and useful presentation of some general principles lying behind the worship of the Roman Church, and is of course given with all the historical and liturgical authority of the famous author.

Another work on the Canon is that of Hugh Williamson, *The Great Prayer* (Collins, 1955, 12s 6d). But this is of a very different nature. The author suggests that the Canon of the Mass, as the expression of the faith of the primitive Church, should be accepted by all branches of the Church to-day. His commentary on the Canon touches on the theological and devotional as well as historical questions. Many of his remarks are valuable, but a great deal is very defective. The history is often inaccurate; the theology as in his discussion of sacrifice in the Eucharist, is to say the least weak; and this attempt to advance the cause of the reunion of Christendom, which seems to be the aim of the book, rests on shaky foundations. The work, however, does have general interest as well as devotional value.

We may mention here the announcement of an English translation of the third edition of A. Baumstark's *Liturgie Comparée* which was edited by Dom Botte. The translation is by Dr F. L. Cross and is to be published by Mowbrays this Spring under the title, *Christian Liturgy and its Sources. Studies in Comparison*. This is a really important work which was referred to in this *Annual* two years ago, when the hope was expressed that it might become available in English. This original and stimulating study can be thoroughly recommended.

Father Archdale A. King has published a further volume of his *opus magnum*. His two-volume *Rites of Eastern Christendom* (Rome, 1947-8) quickly became an authoritative work, and his latest book, *The Rites of the Religious Orders* (London, Longmans Green and Co., 1955, pp. 431, 50s) is also of great value. It gathers together in convenient form a great mass of information dealing with the rites of the Carthusian, Cistercian, Premonstratensian, Carmelite and Dominican Orders, with a shorter discussion of the English Gilbertine rites, and indeed the enquirer will often use this as a kind of encyclopaedia. A brief history of each Order is followed by notes on its distinctive features in architecture, church ornaments, vestments and chant, as well as rite. The development of each rite is described, in relation to Roman and other liturgies. Bibliographical information is given, and the work is illustrated by fifty pictures, many of which are from photographs by the author. We are informed that the chapter on each rite has been read by a member of the Order concerned. Father King promises a further volume on the Rites of the Primatial Sees, and finally a fourth on the Roman liturgy. When these appear, the whole series will act as a revision and considerable enlargement of his valuable *Notes on the Catholic Liturgies*, published by Longmans in 1930.

Attention may be drawn to another Roman Catholic publication, *The Congregation of Sacred Rites*, by Frederick Richard McManus, published by the Catholic University of America Press, Washington, D. C., 1954, pp. 182, 16s. This is an unusually interesting work on an important aspect of Canon Law. It is well-known that this Congregation has as its duty the regulation of the Liturgy, decisions on points of difficulty in rite and ceremony, the supervision of the issue of liturgical books; but it may not be generally realized that it has also to carry out what pertains to the beatification and canonization of Saints, and to sacred relics. This book deals very clearly with the nature of liturgical law, the relation of the Church and the Holy See to sacred worship, the history of the Congregation, the nature of its authority—legislative, judicial and executive—its competence and its relation to other Congregations, its constitution and procedure.

Mention should be made of *Psychology and Worship* by R. S. Lee, S. C. M. Press, 1955, pp. 110, 7s 6d. This small book is written from the Freudian point of view, and while at points it is quite helpful, at others it seems rather defec-

tive. The chapters are headed, Aspiration after God ; The Foundations in Childhood ; Symbol, Ritual and Reason ; The Knowledge of God ; Prayer ; The Holy Communion. The psychological view-point appears to lead the writer to some curious conclusions—an exaggerated emphasis on mother-fixation, the Oedipus complex as being connected with the foundation of worship in childhood, the idea that cannibalism and the playful mother pretending to eat her child have anything to do with Holy Communion. The book seems to centre too much on the human action, the soul seeking God, and too little stress is laid on the idea that man seeks God and finds Him because God has sought him. Nevertheless the writer is often illuminating.

Next we note *The Eucharistic Words of Jesus*, by Joachim Jeremias, Oxford, Blackwell, 1955, pp. 196, 18s. The author's name is a guarantee of the real importance of this book. It is the translation of the second German edition. Jeremias holds that the Last Supper was a Passover, thus taking up the position of the Synoptics as against the Fourth Gospel. He now accepts the longer Lukan text. He brings forward strong arguments for his views, but many readers will remain unconvinced. Thus, it seems that the distinction between the Synoptics and the Fourth Gospel is too strongly emphasized, as if the former were primarily historical and the latter rather devotional or theological ; again the omission from the narratives of all reference to the Passover Lamb, the eating of which was so central a rite in the Passover, is not satisfactorily explained. Nevertheless, this is a book that must be carefully studied by all who are interested in the Eucharist. Though no final answer as to the origins has been reached, this is a necessary step towards a solution.

Finally, we turn to a work which should be widely read and discussed by all interested in questions of worship, *The Liturgical Renaissance in the Roman Catholic Church*, by Ernest Benjamin Koenker, University of Chicago Press (Cambridge U. P.), 1955, pp. 272, 37s 6d. The author, an American Lutheran, is Assistant Professor of Religion at Valparaiso University, and is thus able to examine the movement from an objective and unprejudiced point of view. Certainly he acknowledges that his sympathy with the movement is likely to be "insufficient for Roman Catholic readers and too marked for most Protestants". Insufficient for *some* Roman Catholics, yes—but of course there are Roman Catholics who are opposed to the move-

ment. Too marked for *many* Protestants, yes—but too few Protestants know what the movement stands for or how great its influence may yet be. For both sides the volume is informative and illuminating, particularly perhaps in its theological aspects. We should note that the movement can be referred to under different names—Liturgical Movement, Liturgical Renaissance, Liturgical Apostolate, or Sacramental Apostolate, and it should be remembered that it is concerned not merely with forms of service, rubrics, ceremonies, vestments, and such like. It is not primarily an aesthetic movement, concerned merely with good architecture or good music. These subjects come into the picture, but as means to higher ends, and these ends are concerned with what Pius Parsch calls the twofold function of liturgy—“to lead men to a worship of God pleasing to Him, and to conduct His grace to men”.

Our author then begins with a brief sketch of the historical origins and present status of the movement, and then chapter by chapter discusses the various aims of the movement. Its emphasis is on the community aspect of the Church and especially on the corporateness of worship. It is opposed, for example, to the individualism whereby the worshipper present at the Mass attends to his own devotions instead of really sharing in the rite. The movement demands explicit rather than implicit faith. That is, the worshipper must first learn to understand what goes on in worship, and hence great numbers of readable illustrated booklets are issued, as in France, explaining the various services. Further, they must learn to express their faith explicitly—hence the aim is to get the worshipper to take a larger share in the services, taking part in the responses, for example, and in the Dialogue Mass. This in turn leads to more emphasis on the priesthood of the laity.

Again the movement seeks its inspiration in the early period of liturgical development. As Jungmann has said, the movement “is not intent on introducing new things, but rather it seeks to restore to their pristine glory the primitive forms of Christian worship”. Here appears the value of the many historical studies, such as those of Jungmann himself, which are throwing light on the development of the sacramental system, the whole question of the meaning of sacrifice, and so on. This liturgical study of the early Church has also revealed the centrality of Christ and of the Bible in early thinking, and the movement is giving increasing attention to both these subjects. The doctrine of

sacrifice is being studied afresh, with a movement away from the Tridentine definitions, and closely connected with this is the mystery-theology of Odo Casel and others.

A further consequence is the wide demand for the use of vernacular in worship, a demand supported by certain French, English and American periodicals as well as by many German writers, and permission for this, under strict supervision, has already been given in certain cases. There is further an emphasis on congregational singing, especially in the use of plainsong, and on a new conception of Christian art. Finally, there is a chapter on the relation of the Liturgical Movement to the ecumenical problem.

Enough has been said to show the value and interest of this book. It may be added that the notes are extensive and very valuable ; that the bibliography lists some 500 titles of books, pamphlets and articles on the subject ; and that there is an excellent index.

JOHN A. LAMB